

**MINUTES
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
7447 E. Indian School Road
First Floor Community Development Conference Room
November 13, 2003
5:00 P.M.**

CALL TO ORDER

The meeting was called to order at 5:00 P.M.

ATTENDANCE

Present: Cathy Johnson, Chairperson
Nancy Dallett
B.J. Gonzales
George Hartz
Kathy Howard
Ed Wimmer

Absent: Paul Winslow

Staff: Bob Caferella
Debbie Abele, HPO
Don Meserve

Visitors: Thomas Krawczyk

WELCOME TO NEW COMMISSIONERS, INTRODUCTIONS AND ROLL CALL

A formal roll call confirmed members present as stated above.

Chairperson Johnson introduced Mr. George Hartz as the newly appointed commission member. She reported Paul Winslow, architect, was also appointed to the Commission but was unable to attend because of a prior commitment.

MINUTES

Chairperson Johnson stated that the minutes of October 9, 2003 regular meeting stood approved as presented.

PUBLIC HEARING/ACTION ITEMS: INITIATION OF THREE HP ZONING CASES

Ms. Abele provided an overview of the initiation process for HP overlay zoning cases. She stated at this point in the process there would not be any presentations or information provided about the merits and eligibility of the properties for designation consideration. This simply starts the process. She further stated a flow chart contained in the Commission packet outlines the steps to zone property HP and place it on the Scottsdale Historic Register. They are at Step 3 of the process.

Ms. Able reported the Commission would need to act on each on of these items separately. She further reported an appropriate motion would be to move to initiate the HP zoning stating the name and address of the property.

Initiation of HP-Historic Property Zoning for Sugar Bowl Resturant: Consider the Historic Preservation Commission initiating an HP overlay zoning case for the Sugar Bowl Resturant at 4005 N. Scottsdale Road, owned by Huntress Trusts, Ms. Jaclyn Krawczyk, Ms. Margery Morton, and Mr. Frederick Huntress, to place the property on the Scottsdale Historic Register.

Mr. Krawczyk, husband of Mrs. Krawczyk, one of the owners, inquired if the application applied to the entire building or just the Sugar Bowl portion. Ms. Abele replied it would include the entire property known as the Sugar Bowl building, 3935 and 4005 N. Scottsdale Road.

Commissioner Wimmer moved for initiation of HP-Historic Property Zoning for the Sugar Bowl building at 3935 and 4005 N. Scottsdale Road. Seconded by Commissioner Gonzales and passed unanimously.

Initiation of HP-Historic Property Zoning For Pink Pony Resturant: Consider the Historic Preservation Commission initiating an HP overlay zoning case for the Pink Pony Resturant at 3831 N. Scottsdale Road, owned by Ms. Gwen Briley, to place the property on the Scottsdale Historic Register.

Commissioner Gonzales commented that this was not the original Pink Pony building. Ms. Abele stated the desire is to designate the current building that houses the Pink Pony today.

Commissioner Hartz inquired about the timeline for future steps. Ms. Abele stated they hope to have these cases for public hearing, Step 11, before the Commission by February and go before the Planning Commission in March and before the City Council in May for National Historic Preservation Week.

Commissioner Wimmer inquired if the owners of the building are supportive of this designation. Ms. Abele replied in the affirmative.

Commissioner Gonzales moved for initiation of HP-Historic Property Zoning for Pink Pony Resturant at 3831 N. Scottsdale Road. Seconded by Commissioner Hartz and passed unanimously.

Initiation of HP-Historic Property Zoning for the Simonson Building: Consider the Historic Preservation Commission initiating an HP overlay zoning case for the Simonson Building at 3950 N. Brown Avenue, owned by Sunbrella Properties LTD, to place the property on the Scottsdale Historic Register.

Commissioner Wimmer inquired if they have the support of the property owners for this nomination. Ms. Abele replied in the affirmative.

Commissioner Dallett moved for initiation of HP-Historic Property Zoning for the Simonson Building at 3950 N. Brown Avenue. Seconded by Commissioner Howard and passed unanimously.

REGULAR AGENDA ITEMS

REPORT ON BUILDING CONDITION ASSESSMENT REPORT AND DISCUSSION ON THE CRAFTSMAN COURT DESIGN GUIDELINES SECTION OF THE HP PLAN

Ms. Abele stated an excerpt from Historic Preservation Ordinance Section 6.119 is contained in the Commission packet as a reminder that the designation on the Scottsdale Historic Register is the first step in the work that needs to be accomplished. She remarked staff prepares a designation report (historic significance and integrity assessment report) because they have the responsibility during the public hearing process to put on record those things about the property that they consider important as a reason for designating it a historic property.

She provided a brief overview on the process for preparing the building condition assessment (BCA) report for properties zoned HP. The building assessment report aids the property owner in understanding the current condition to help them in the planning, maintenance, and repair. Ms. Abele reported that not all of the seven buildings in Craftsman Court (now Kiva Center) are of equal historic significance. She further reported the need to look at each building individually.

Ms. Abele stated the complex is composed of multiple buildings arranged around a central courtyard, with views from public rights-of-way into the complex interior. She noted the pedestrian scale created by the one-story height buildings along street frontages. There is a strong relationship of indoor space to the outdoors in the design. She reviewed a list of the character-defining features for buildings 1, 2 & 7, buildings 3, 4, 6, and 6a, and building 5 and 5a.

Commissioner Dallett inquired if the original design of these buildings was responding to anything in the vicinity. Ms. Abele replied in the negative noting that it was an open field at the time the building was designed and constructed.

Commissioner Gonzales provided historical information on this site and individuals involved.

Ms. Abele reviewed the proposed guidelines for rehabilitation, additions, and new construction.

Commissioner Wimmer stated the metal screening for the air conditioning units has always troubled him. Ms. Abele stated that issue is addressed under rehabilitation guideline No. 10.

Commissioner Dallett inquired if the entryway signage would be part of the design guidelines. Ms. Abele stated the sign is very contemporary and was part of the '93 redo. They can certainly encourage them to have appropriate signage.

Mr. Meserve suggested under additions No. 2 they include pedestrian walkways.

Ms. Abele stated they would have another work session at the December meeting and go back through this information.

Chairperson Johnson requested that everyone go to Craftsman Court before the December meeting. Chairperson Johnson reminded the commissioners' when they go out to look at these buildings to not make comments.

COMMITTEE REPORTS

Historic Register Committee

Commissioner Wimmer reported they did have a very constructive committee meeting and went through the entire issue of the criteria for the subdivisions and chose the top candidate neighborhoods. Staff assigned two people to each neighborhood to do a building assessment on those buildings to see if they complied with the guidelines. They want to have that completed after the first of the year. He further reported their next meeting is scheduled for December 3, 2003 at 5:15 pm.

Education Outreach Committee

Chairperson Johnson stated Janet Wilson has been the Chairperson of this committee and since she is no longer on the Commission, they would need to appoint another commission member to serve as Chairperson. She further stated Janet is willing to serve as co-Chair. Chairperson Johnson read the Mission Statement for the Education Outreach Committee and outlined the role and responsibilities to allow someone to determine if they would like to serve on the committee. Commissioner Hartz volunteered to serve and will contact Janet Wilson for more information.

HPO/STAFF REPORT AND ANNOUNCEMENTS

Ms. Abele reported on September 23, 2003, Taliesin West property went to the City Council to receive funding assistance in a development agreement. As part of the terms of receiving funding, Taliesin West has agreed to be designated a historical property (HP) and placed on the Scottsdale Historic Register. She further reported the City has 90 days from September 23, 2003 under the terms of the agreement to form the district boundary and initiate the HP overlay zoning case. She noted the Frank Lloyd Wright Foundation is committed to working with various consultants to do extensive research on the evolution of the Frank Lloyd Wright buildings.

Ms. Able reported on November 5, 2004, the Planning Commission unanimously approved a recommendation to City Council to approve the Cattle Track site plan. Mr. Meserve stated that case, 35-ZN-1995#4, is scheduled to go to the City Council for a hearing on January 6, 2004.

Ms. Abele stated the City Council approved the incentive package for the Hotel Valley Ho by a five to one vote on November 4, 2003. This portion of the HP Plan required Council approval.

Mr. Meserve stated information is included in the Commission packets on other States that have completed research on the economic impacts of historic preservation. This information was compiled in response to a Commission request for information on economic impacts.

Mr. Meserve requested commissioners' comments by the end of the year on the draft Guide to Mitigation Plans, describing Scottsdale's archaeology requirements for mitigation. The draft was mailed to Commissioners for comments on October 15, 2003.

Chairperson Johnson stated she attended the Building for Success panel at the Civic Center Library noting it was a wonderful presentation. She further stated that Ms. Abele did a wonderful job with her talk on neighborhoods in the southern part of Scottsdale. She also thanked Mr. Meserve for preparing the powerpoint component of the presentation.

Mr. Meserve inquired if the Commission wanted to participate in the Parada del Sol Parade held on January 31, 2004. Chairperson Johnson stated the commissioners' generally ride on a covered wagon or flatbed and wave to the crowd. She further stated people enjoy having them participate. The Commission agreed to participate in the 2004 Parada del Sol Parade.

Mr. Meserve stated the City is involved in SolFest event in April and they have added an extra event on Friday called KidFest to educate children on the environment and they are looking for volunteers to help assist with the Friday event. He further stated the Environmental Quality Advisory Board (EQAB) is also seeking a resolution of support.

Chairperson Johnson stated they would have the Education Committee look into that.

COMMISSIONER COMMENTS / PUBLIC COMMENT

Commissioner Gonzales commented that he felt they have received very positive response from the Planning Commission and City Council regarding the Hotel Valley Ho and he felt that would put a positive spin on their efforts.

Commissioner Gonzales reported that the parish for Our Lady of Perpetual Help Mission Church has hired an architect and will be performing some renovations of this historic property on Brown Avenue. Ms. Abele stated those renovations are a result of the Building Condition Assessment report prepared by Don Ryden, architect funded by the Historic Preservation Program. She further stated the City has provided fire sprinklers for the Mission Church for fire safety.

FUTURE MEETINGS AND AGENDA ITEMS

Chairperson Johnson stated the Commission needs to look at the calendar and set a date for the annual January retreat. The consensus of the Commission was to hold the retreat on Saturday, January 24, 2004.

Ms. Abele stated that they also need to plan a training session on the roles and responsibilities of the Commission.

Chairperson Johnson reported the next meeting will be held on December 11, 2003.

Meeting adjourned at 6:50 p.m.

Submitted by:

For the Record Court Reporters

111303min